

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

THE PNC FINANCIAL SERVICES GROUP,	)	
INC. and PNC BANK, N.A., Individually and as	)	
Successor in Interest to NATIONAL CITY	)	
BANK,	)	CIVIL DIVISION
	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	No. 2:13-cv-00331-CB-MPK
	)	
v.	)	
	)	
HOUSTON CASUALTY COMPANY and	)	
AXIS INSURANCE COMPANY,	)	
	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
	)	

---

**JOINT STIPULATION OF DAMAGES**

Plaintiffs The PNC Financial Services Group, Inc. and PNC Bank, N.A., Individually and as Successor in Interest to National City Bank (“PNC”) and Defendants Houston Casualty Company (“HCC”) and AXIS Insurance Company (“AXIS”) (collectively, the “Parties”) submit this Joint Stipulation of Damages pursuant to the Court’s scheduling Order of December 9, 2014 (Doc. #72).

In the Court’s Orders of June 24, 2014 (Doc. #63) and July 28, 2014 (Doc. #68) (the “Orders”), the Court ruled, *inter alia*, that certain amounts sought by PNC under the insurance policies at issue (the “Policies”) should be paid as “Loss” under the Policies. The Court ruled, however, that it required more information from the Parties based on the existing record, “because the parties have not provided an adequate detailing of all **Claims Expenses** or **Damages** paid by PNC” and, thus, an issue of fact remained unresolved. Subsequently, the Parties agreed to provide the Court with “a joint stipulation regarding the agreed-upon amount of

PNC's covered 'Loss' pursuant to the Court's June 24 and July 28, 2014 orders or, if necessary, a joint proposal for an expedited procedure for the Court to resolve any remaining issues."

Scheduling Order (Doc. 72) at 2.

Pursuant to the Court's Orders and its directive to the Parties, the Parties have reached a compromise agreement and jointly stipulate that, as of January 21, 2015, the date of PNC's most recent submission of invoices to HCC and AXIS, that PNC's incurred "Loss," as referenced in the Orders, is as follows:

1. PNC has paid a total of \$29,235,643.00 in the MDL in class plaintiffs' attorneys' fees and costs, plaintiffs' incentive awards, settlement administration costs, and notice administration costs. This total includes the amounts listed in the Court's June 24, 2014 Memorandum Order, as well as an additional \$2,022,341.42 in settlement and notice administration costs paid in connection with the MDL.

2. PNC has paid a total of \$5,863,125.78 in *Trombley* in class plaintiffs' attorneys' fees and costs, plaintiffs' services awards, settlement administration costs, and notice administration costs. This total includes the following amounts listed in the Court's June 24, 2014 Memorandum Order, as well as an additional \$2,770,268.73 in claims administration and notice administration costs.

3. PNC has paid \$2,853,459.60 in defense costs and expenses, including attorneys', experts', and other service providers' fees and costs, in the *Trombley* and MDL actions.

4. Thus, PNC's total paid "Loss" pursuant to the Court's Orders, through January 21, 2015, is \$37,952,228.38.

This stipulation is based upon and is in response to the Orders, as well as the Court's Scheduling Order of December 9, 2014 (Doc. #72), and is without waiver of any Party's

appellate rights to challenge the Court's rulings or any right the Parties may have with respect any dispute that may arise as to how the Orders should be interpreted.

All Parties request leave to submit on or before February 17, 2015 a proposed form of Final Judgment and Order of Dismissal, in accordance with the Court's Orders on the Parties' cross-motions for judgment on the pleadings. The proposed form of Final Judgment and Order of Dismissal would account for recent developments, which may reduce the aggregate limits of liability available to satisfy a judgment under one of the insurance policies at issue. The Parties anticipate that the proposed Final Judgment and Order of Dismissal will also contain a compromise agreement as to pre-judgment interest. At the Court's direction, Counsel would be pleased to provide the Court with any additional detail it requires.

Respectfully submitted,

REED SMITH LLP

BY: /s/ Courtney C.T. Horrigan

Douglas E. Cameron

Pa. I.D. No. 41644

Courtney C.T. Horrigan

Pa. I.D. No. 70427

Robert H. Owen

Pa. I.D. No. 91406

Caitlin R. Garber

Pa. I.D. No. 311321

Reed Smith LLP

(Firm I.D. No. 234)

225 Fifth Avenue

Pittsburgh, PA 15222

412-288-3131

Fax: 412-288-3063

dcameron@reedsmith.com

chorrigan@reedsmith.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs The PNC Financial Services Group, Inc. and PNC Bank, N.A., Individually and as Successor In Interest to National City Bank*

THOMAS, THOMAS & HAER

BY: /s/ Thomas P. McGinnis  
Thomas P. McGinnis  
Thomas, Thomas & Haer  
One Oxford Centre  
301 Grant Street, Suite 1150  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
tmcginnis@tthlaw.com

*Local Counsel for Houston Casualty Company and  
AXIS Insurance Company*

SHIPMAN & GOODWIN LLP

BY: /s/ Joseph A. Bailey III  
Douglas M. Mangel  
Joseph A. Bailey III  
Shipman & Goodwin LLP  
1875 K Street NW, Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20006-1251  
dmangel@goodwin.com  
jbailey@goodwin.com

*Counsel for Houston Casualty Company*

WILEY REIN, LLP

BY: /s/ Jason P. Cronic  
Jason P. Cronic  
John E. Barry  
Wiley Rein, LLP  
1776 K. Street  
Washington, DC 20006  
jcronic@wileyrein.com  
jhowell@wileyrein.com

*Counsel for AXIS Insurance Company*

February 6, 2015

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing JOINT STIPULATION OF DAMAGES has been served via ECF on all counsel of record.

Dated: February 6, 2015

/s/ Courtney C.T. Horrigan